

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

SERIAL NO.: 10/774,907

CONFIRMATION NO. 8785

APPLICANT: **Paprotna**

FILED: February 9, 2004

GROUP ART UNIT: 3673

EXAMINER: **Patel, Vishal A.**

ATTORNEY  
DOCKET NO.:

CUSTOMER NO.:

**FOR: Seal Usable Between Thermally Movable Components**

Mail Stop Appeal Brief - Patents  
Commissioner for Patents  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

DATE: October 8, 2007

## SECOND REVISED APPEAL BRIEF

Sir:

The Notification of Appeal was filed on February 21, 2007. A Notice of Non-Compliant Appeal Brief was mailed June 6, 2007 which was responded to via the Revised Appeal Brief filed on June 29, 2007. A second Notice of Non-Compliant Appeal Brief was

subsequently mailed 9/12/07 and again on 9/20/07 which is responded to via the instant

Second Revised Appeal Brief.

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<b>I. REAL PARTY IN INTEREST</b>	Page 3
<b>II. RELATED APPEALS AND INTERFERENCES</b>	Page 4
<b>III. STATUS OF CLAIMS</b>	Page 5
<b>IV. STATUS OF AMENDMENTS</b>	Page 6
<b>V. SUMMARY OF CLAIMED SUBJECT MATTER</b>	Page 7
<b>VI. GROUNDS OF REJECTION TO BE REVIEWED ON APPEAL</b>	Page 8
<b>VII. ARGUMENTS</b>	Page 9
<b>VIII. CLAIMS APPENDIX</b>	Page 12
<b>IX. EVIDENCE APPENDIX</b>	Page 17
<b>X. RELATED PROCEEDINGS APPENDIX</b>	Page 18

**I. REAL PARTY IN INTEREST**

The real party in interest in connection with the above identified patent application is Siemens Power Generation, Inc., the assignee of record.

## **II. RELATED APPEALS AND INTERFERENCES**

There exist no related appeals or interferences in connection with the above-identified patent application.

### **III. STATUS OF CLAIMS**

Claims 1, 3, 4 and 6-20 are pending in the patent application, and claims 1, 3, 4 and 6-20 are rejected. Claims 2 and 5 have been canceled without prejudice, and claims 8-20 have been withdrawn. Claims 1, 3, 4, 6 and 7 are being appealed.

#### **IV. STATUS OF AMENDMENTS**

No amendments were filed after issuance of the final office action dated June 29, 2006. All previous amendments have been entered.

## **V. SUMMARY OF CLAIMED SUBJECT MATTER**

Claim 1 is directed to a seal (10 - See e.g., page 5, line 3) usable between two thermally movable components (12, 14 - See e.g., page 5, line 10), comprising: a body (16 - See e.g., page 5, line 2) for sealing space between adjacent components (12, 14) to prevent a fluid from passing through the space; wherein the body (16) has a cross-section that has a first side (20 - See e.g., page 5, line 5), a second side (22 - See e.g., page 5, line 5) generally opposite to the first side (20), a first end (24 - See e.g., page 5, line 5), and a second end (26 - See e.g., page 5, line 6) generally opposite to the first end (24), wherein the first and second sides (20, 22) have lengths longer than lengths of the first and second ends (24, 26); wherein the first end (24) includes at least one first tooth (36 - See e.g., page 5, line 28) extending from a region (42 - See e.g., page 5, line 8) on the first end (24) proximate to an intersection (44 - See e.g., page 6, line 8) between the first end (24) and the first side (20) and extending toward the second side (22) of the body (16) and at least one second tooth (36) extending from a region (42) on the first end (24) proximate to an intersection (44 - See e.g., page 6, line 8) between the first end (24) and the second side (22) and extending toward the first side (20) of the body (16). The seal is usable between components of a turbine engine. The claimed invention is described in the specification at pages 5 and 6 shown in Figures 6-8.



## **VI. GROUNDS OF REJECTION TO BE REVIEWED ON APPEAL**

The following grounds of rejection are requested to be reviewed on appeal. In particular, first, the Examiner rejected claim 1 under 35 U.S.C. §102(b) as being anticipated by United States Patent No. 4,524,981 to *Hertz, Jr.* Second, the Examiner rejected claims 1-3 and 5-7 under 35 U.S.C. §102(b) as being anticipated by United States Patent No. 5,975,844 to *Milazar*. Third, the Examiner rejected claims 3 and 4 under 35 U.S.C. §103(a) as being unpatentable over *Hertz, Jr.* and rejected claim 4 under 35 U.S.C. §103(a) as being unpatentable over *Milazar*.

## VII. ARGUMENTS

### I. REJECTION OF CLAIM 1 UNDER 35 U.S.C. §102(b)

The Examiner rejected claim 1 under 35 U.S.C. §102(b) as being anticipated by United States Patent No. 4,524,981 to *Hertz, Jr.* The Examiner stated that *Hertz, Jr.* discloses a seal having a body with a cross-section having a first side, a second side, a first end and a second end, wherein the first and second sides have lengths longer than lengths of the first and second ends. The Examiner also stated that *Hertz, Jr.* discloses a first end having a tooth extending from a region on the first end proximate to an intersection between the first end and the first side and extending toward the second side and the first end having a second tooth extending from a region on the first end proximate to an intersection between the first and the second side and extending toward the first side of the body. The Examiner also stated that *Hertz, Jr.* discloses other claimed elements as well.

*Hertz, Jr.* discloses annular seal with a V-cut, as set forth appropriately in the title of the patent. As shown in Figure 1, *Hertz, Jr.* discloses an annular seal (20) for a wellhead valve (10). The annular seal (20) includes grooves (34a & b) in the inner seal face (22) and the outer seal face (24). The grooves (34a & b) enable the seal (20) to compressed when subjected to a compression force.

In sharp contrast, the claimed invention in claim 1 is directed, in relevant part, to a "first end [that] includes at least one first tooth extending from a region on the first end proximate to an intersection between the first end and the first side and extending toward the second side of the body and at least one second tooth extending from a region on the first end

proximate to an intersection between the first end and the second side and extending toward the first side of the body." Thus, the claimed seal includes at least one tooth that extends from a first end. In contrast, the annular seal of *Hertz, Jr.* discloses an annular seal with grooves cut into inner and outer sealing surfaces. *Hertz, Jr.* does not disclose a seal with teeth extending from an end of the seal. Thus, *Hertz, Jr.* does not anticipate claim 1, and the Examiner is respectfully requested to withdraw the rejection.

## II. REJECTION OF CLAIMS 1, 3 AND 6-7 UNDER 35 U.S.C. §102(b)

The Examiner rejected claims 1-3 and 5-7 under 35 U.S.C. §102(b) as being anticipated by United States Patent No. 5,975,844 to *Milazar*. The Examiner stated that *Milazar* discloses a seal usable between two thermally movable components. The Examiner stated that *Milazar* further discloses a seal comprising a body having a longitudinal axis and the body having a cross-section orthogonal to the longitudinal axis that has a first side, a second side generally opposite to the first side, a first end, and a second end generally opposite to the first end. The Examiner also stated that *Milazar* discloses that the first end of the body is formed from a compliant material.

Claim 1 states in relevant part "wherein the first and second sides have lengths longer than lengths of the first and second ends . . . ." The amendment places the teeth on a first end that is shorter than the first and second sides. In contrast, *Milazar* discloses a plurality of teeth extending from a first side of a seal body, not teeth extending from a first end of a seal body that is shorter than the first and second sides of the seal body, as claimed in claim 1. In

addition, *Milazar* does not disclose curved teeth, as claimed in claim 7. Therefore, for at least these reasons, claim 1, and those claims depending therefrom, are not anticipated by *Milazar*, and the Examiner is respectfully requested to withdraw the rejection.

### **III. REJECTION OF CLAIMS 3 AND 4 UNDER 35 U.S.C. §103**

The Examiner rejected claims 3 and 4 under 35 U.S.C. §103(a) as being unpatentable over *Hertz, Jr.* and rejected claim 4 under 35 U.S.C. §103(a) as being unpatentable over *Milazar*. Claims 3 and 4 depend from claim 1, which is allowable for the reasons previously set forth. Thus, the Examiner is respectfully requested to withdraw the rejection.

## VIII. CLAIMS APPENDIX

1. A seal usable between two thermally movable components, comprising:  
a body for sealing space between adjacent components to prevent a fluid from passing through the space;

wherein the body has a cross-section that has a first side, a second side generally opposite to the first side, a first end, and a second end generally opposite to the first end, wherein the first and second sides have lengths longer than lengths of the first and second ends;

wherein the first end includes at least one first tooth extending from a region on the first end proximate to an intersection between the first end and the first side and extending toward the second side of the body and at least one second tooth extending from a region on the first end proximate to an intersection between the first end and the second side and extending toward the first side of the body.

2. (Canceled)

3. The seal of claim 1, wherein the at least one first tooth is at an angle of between about 30 degrees and about 60 degrees relative to an outer surface of the first end and the at least one second tooth is at an angle of between about 30 degrees and about 60 degrees relative to the outer surface of the first end.

4. The seal of claim 3, wherein the at least one first tooth is at an angle of about 45 degrees and the at least one second tooth is at an angle of about 45 degrees.

5. (Canceled)

6. The seal of claim 1, wherein the at least one first tooth extending from the region on the first end proximate to the intersection between the first end and the first side comprise three teeth, and the at least one second tooth extending from the region on the first end proximate to the intersection between the first end and the second side comprise three teeth.

7. The seal of claim 1, wherein the teeth are curved.

8. (Withdrawn) The seal of claim 1, wherein the compliant material is selected from the group consisting of a feltmetal, a honeycomb, and a brush seal.

9. (Withdrawn) The seal of claim 1, wherein the second end is formed from a compliant material configured to absorb thermal expansion of the two thermally movable components.

10. (Withdrawn) The seal of claim 9, wherein the second end includes at least one tooth extending from the second end.

11. (Withdrawn) The seal of claim 10, wherein the at least one tooth is at an angle of between about 30 degrees and about 60 degrees relative to an outer surface of the first end.

12. (Withdrawn) The seal of claim 11, wherein the at least one tooth is at an angle of about 45 degrees.

13. (Withdrawn) The seal of claim 9, wherein at least one tooth extends from a region proximate to an intersection between the first end and the first side and at least one tooth extends from a region proximate to an intersection between the first end and the second side.

14. (Withdrawn) The seal of claim 13, wherein the at least one tooth extending from the region proximate to an intersection between the first end and the first side comprise three teeth and the at least one tooth extending from the region proximate to an intersection between the first end and the second side comprise three teeth.

15. (Withdrawn) The seal of claim 13, wherein the teeth are curved.

16. (Withdrawn) A seal usable between two thermally movable components, comprising:

a body having a longitudinal axis for sealing space between adjacent components to prevent a fluid from passing through the space;

wherein the body has a cross-section generally orthogonal to the longitudinal axis that has a first side, a second side generally opposite to the first side, a first end, and a second end generally opposite to the first end;

wherein the first end is formed from a compliant material configured to absorb thermal expansion of the two thermally movable components, and the first end includes at least one tooth extending from the first end;

wherein the second end is formed from a compliant material configured to absorb thermal expansion of the two thermally movable components.

17. (Withdrawn) The seal of claim 16, wherein the first end includes at least one tooth extending from the first end, and the second end includes at least one tooth extending from the second end.

18. (Withdrawn) The seal of claim 17, wherein the at least one tooth of the first end is at an angle of between about 30 degrees and about 60 degrees relative to an outer



surface of the first end, and the at least one tooth of the second end is at an angle of between about 30 degrees and about 60 degrees relative to an outer surface of the second end.

19. (Withdrawn) The seal of claim 17, wherein at least one tooth extends from a region proximate to an intersection between the first end and the first side and at least one tooth extends from a region proximate to an intersection between the first end and the second side.

20. (Withdrawn) The seal of claim 16, wherein the compliant material is selected from the group consisting of a feltmetal, a honeycomb, and a brush seal.

**IX. EVIDENCE APPENDIX**

None.

**X. RELATED PROCEEDINGS APPENDIX**

None.

### CONCLUSION

For at least the reasons given above, claims 1, 3, 4, 6 and 7 define patentable subject matter and are thus allowable. The Applicant requests withdrawal of the rejections and allowance of the claims.

Dated: 10/8/07

Siemens Corporation  
Intellectual Property Department  
170 Wood Avenue South  
Iselin, New Jersey 08830

Respectfully submitted,

By: 

Erik C. Swanson  
Registration No. 40,194  
(407) 736-5602

Attorney Docket No.: 2004P00441US